

The *H*istorical Review
La Revue *H*istorique

VOLUME I (2004)

Contents/Table des matières

FOREWORD/AVANT-PROPOS <i>Paschalis M. Kitromilides</i>	7
L'histoire littéraire peut-elle être expérimentale? <i>Eva Kushner</i>	9
Voix des peuples et idée de nation chez Herder <i>Mario Longo</i>	19
The History of a Sixteenth-Century Greek Type Revised <i>Evro Layton</i>	35
Towards Modern Greek Consciousness <i>Loukia Droulia</i>	51
Diversité des théories libérales en Grèce au XIXe siècle <i>Roxane Argyropoulos</i>	69
Représentations de Constantinople après la chute: prolongements idéologiques <i>Eugénie Drakopoulou</i>	89
Les sociétés insulaires de la mer Égée au temps de la domination ottomane: routes communes et trajectoires séparées <i>Dimitris Dimitropoulos</i>	113
'Topos' and Utopia in Evgenios Voulgaris' Life and Work (1716-1806) <i>Iannis C. Carras</i>	127
A Founder on Founding: Jefferson's Advice to Koraes <i>Ioannis D. Evrigenis</i>	157

British Philhellenism and the Historiography of Greece: a Case Study of George Finlay (1799-1875)	183
<i>Liz Potter</i>	
Jules Verne's Captain Nemo and French Revolutionary Gustave Flourens: A Hidden Character Model?	207
<i>Leonidas Kallivretakis</i>	
On Entrepreneurs and Entrepreneurship of the Olive-Oil Economy in the Aegean: the Case of Lesvos Island	245
<i>Evrildiki Sifneos</i>	
CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES/APPROCHES CRITIQUES	
H.W. Lack with D. J. Mabberley, <i>The Flora Graeca Story</i>	275
<i>Costas B. Krimbas</i>	
Milestones in the Historiography of the Cyprus Question	285
<i>Paschalis M. Kitromilides</i>	

EVA KUSHNER

RÉSUMÉ: L'histoire littéraire était longtemps considérée comme le fondement nécessaire à toute critique littéraire, ce qui rendait le contexte historique un facteur fondamental à la formation et l'interprétation des œuvres. L'histoire littéraire traditionnelle est caractérisée par une unité qui détermine le contenu en termes d'inclusions et d'exclusions, elle assimile l'hétérogénéité dans des ensembles cohérents qui peu à peu deviennent entités englobantes dans un devenir collectif. Les facteurs historiques contextuels acquièrent un impact pris pour acquis plutôt que démontré. L'histoire littéraire sert ainsi les aspirations nationales, elle est une totalité vivante au sein de l'histoire nationale qui l'englobe. Ces pratiques totalisantes et universalisantes ont eu quelques alternatives. En 1967, Hans Robert Jauss proposait une histoire littéraire fondée sur la réception esthétique des textes, selon un «horizon d'attente» en fonction duquel une œuvre a été créée et reçue. Pour Michael Riffaterre l'histoire littéraire narrative devrait être associée à l'approche stylistique, à l'analyse textuelle.

L'histoire littéraire, tant traditionnelle que novatrice, a pu résister aux critiques et aux transformations. Elle a assuré sa survie en tant que pratique liée à l'essor des cultures, du fait qu'elle a pu devenir plus expérimentale, accepter le provisoire, et devenir discours de la recherche plutôt que de l'affirmation.

MARIO LONGO

RÉSUMÉ: L'idée de nation se manifeste dans le contexte de la pensée herderienne du langage, en polémique avec les idéaux cosmopolites du siècle des Lumières. En niant une nature humaine toujours égale et sans différences qualitatives, Herder soutient l'originalité de chaque moment du développement historique, compte tenu de la nature linguistique, et donc historique, de l'homme. En utilisant une métaphore suggérée par Herder, l'humanité est un concert polyphonique, d'autant plus majestueux et harmonique que son orchestration est riche et nombreuse. Écouter la voix des peuples pour comprendre l'homme dans son expression la plus étendue: ceci est l'objectif des recherches linguistiques et historico-littéraires du jeune Herder aboutissant dans l'imposant tableau historique de *Auch eine Philosophie der Geschichte*. Cette vision de l'histoire, qui tend à mettre en valeur le fragment et les parties, ne conduit pas toutefois au relativisme historique, à la négation du sens universel de l'histoire, mais vise à critiquer un modèle de cosmopolitisme à la Voltaire, froid et abstrait, qui ne sait comprendre et aimer que soi-même, ayant glorifié à tel point le principe de sa propre culture qu'il reste indifférent à toutes les autres manifestations de la vie des peuples. Il en ressort, d'un côté, une vive appréciation pour l'âme de chaque peuple, âme qui par la magie du langage vit dans ses expressions les plus authentiques dans la poésie, dans les mythes et dans la religion, et, d'autre part, la primauté attribuée à ces facteurs spirituels de la vie des peuples par rapport à l'organisation politique de l'état. L'idée de nation pour Herder ne se résout donc pas dans la négation du cosmopolitisme, mais

plutôt dans le refus de ce cosmopolitisme basé sur la politique, propre du siècle des Lumières, qui avait fait de la création de l’État-machine un modèle que l’on aurait voulu imposer à tous les peuples de la terre.

EVRO LAYTON

ABSTRACT: This article attempts to study the history of a sixteenth-century Greek type in Italy. The type was produced under the auspices of Cardinal Marcello Cervini who wished to publish some of the manuscripts from the Vatican Collections. Cervini commissioned the Roman printer Antonio Blado to be in charge of the project. Since Blado did not own Greek type and had no experience with Greek he invited Stefano Nicolini da Sabbio, the noted printer of Greek in Venice, to come to Rome and take charge of the cardinal’s project. The scholar-scribe Nikolaos Sophianos also joined the project along with Benedetto Giunta, a bookseller in Rome who represented the cardinal. The Greek font designed and cut for this project appeared in several works in Rome and was designated by scholars as Greek 1. To this day nobody has been able to match Greek 1 with the handwriting of any of the scribes working in Italy during this period. When the association of Sophianos with the cardinal’s project came to an end, Greek 1 became very much in demand and was used by a number of well-known printers in Rome, Florence and Venice. It required a series of legal actions to prove that Greek 1 belonged to Sophianos who finally took possession of his type and other equipment. He used it to print a number of publications. The type later passed into the hands of Vasileios and Hippolitos Valeris and later to some other minor publishers of Greek liturgical books. It was still in use as late as the mid-1580s.

LOUKIA DROULIA

ABSTRACT: This paper deals with the subject of Modern Greek consciousness which can be said epigrammatically to have its starting point in the Provisional Constitution of Greece ratified by the Assembly of Epidaurus in January 1822. For it was then necessary that two crucial questions be answered, namely who were to be considered as citizens of the new state about to be created and what regions it covered. The attempt to find answers to these questions necessarily led to the re-examination of the Greek nation’s historical course over the millenia.

For this purpose the terms that express the concepts which register the self-definition of a human group and their use over time, are here examined as well as the links that formed the connection between the groups of Greek-speaking Orthodox Christians who, as a result of historical circumstances, had until then been geographically scattered. One solid link was the unbroken use of their common language; the “ancestral culture” was the other definitive element which had a continuous though uneven presence throughout the centuries. Finally the “place”, having preserved the same geographical name, “Hellas”,

through the centuries although its borders were certainly unclear, now took on a weighty significance as regards the conscious identification of the historical land with the new state that the Greeks were struggling to create in the nineteenth century. These and other factors contributed to the acceptance by the Greek nation of the nomenclature *Ellines*, *Ellada* which were unanimously adopted during the Greek war of Independence, instead of the terms *Graikoi*, *Romioi*, *Graikia*.

ROXANE D. ARGYROPOULOS

RÉSUMÉ: Étudier l'émergence du mouvement libéral en Grèce au XIXe siècle implique une série de difficultés d'interprétation. C'est appréhender un univers qui a été légué par la Révolution française et nous conduit à l'acquisition de principes indispensables au fonctionnement d'une société démocratique moderne. Y travers des types de discours différents, nous essayons de suivre les traces de cette mise en œuvre du principe de la liberté de 1830 jusqu'à la veille du premier conflit mondial. On assiste après 1830, à une période de transition mais également de mise en œuvre des idées novatrices des Lumières. Les libéraux grecs ont pris fait et cause pour des combats concernant le respect de la vie humaine, la réciprocité des droits et des devoirs et sont dominés par la préoccupation de la liberté d'expression et de création, l'abolition de la peine de mort, l'idéal républicain, l'instruction publique, le défi du progrès. Depuis les années 1830 jusqu'en 1870, se réclamer du libéralisme, c'est s'inscrire dans les forces progressistes. Mais, la dernière phase de son édification fut liée à la montée du socialisme et du marxisme, qu'il allait remettre en question, et dans les années qui ont suivi la défaite de 1897, le libéralisme est confronté à des théories comme la pensée polyvalente de Nietzsche. Dans les différentes phases de l'évolution de la pensée libérale en Grèce, on observe des variations qui pour la plupart sont des étapes du processus vers la démocratie.

EUGÉNIE DRAKOPOULOU

RÉSUMÉ: L'image de Constantinople, liée à son mythe et au mythe du dernier empereur, apparaît après la chute de la ville, dans l'iconographie tant occidentale qu'orthodoxe, sur des icônes portatives, des manuscrits et des fresques dans les églises et les demeures patriciennes.

L'événement même de la prise de la ville, en tant que représentation indépendante ou incorporée à des cycles iconographiques existants, est représenté plusieurs fois, entre les premières années après la chute et le XIXe siècle, dans la peinture de l'Occident et de l'Orient orthodoxe. L'image de la ville de Constantinople, dans les années suivant sa chute, devient symbole de la supériorité et de la victoire du christianisme, symbole d'opulence, de prospérité et de vie cosmopolite, symbole de la libération de l'hellénisme asservi, mais aussi de la coexistence des mondes orthodoxe et musulman.

Dans ce travail, nous avons voulu repérer les différents messages, ethno-culturels, politiques et religieux dont sont chargées, selon les époques et les besoins, les représentations de Constantinople dans la peinture après sa prise par les Turcs.

DIMITRIS DIMITROPOULOS

RÉSUMÉ: L'objectif de ce texte est d'identifier les éléments qui ont joué un rôle unificateur et, respectivement, les facteurs qui ont différencié les îles de la mer Égée, pendant la domination ottomane. Il traite notamment du rôle qu'ont joué l'emplacement géographique, l'insularité, et la grandeur de chaque île, dans la formation de leur économie et la constitution des sociétés locales. L'argumentation se concentre surtout sur les petites îles de l'Égée et sur des sujets comme la forme et le type des bourgades, le caractère de leur fortification et son évolution, le rôle et les effets du pouvoir ottoman dans les institutions locales et l'administration communale, le caractère de l'économie insulaire et ses rapports avec la mer, les réseaux de communication entre les insulaires et l'évolution indépendante et particulière de chaque île, les déplacements des populations de et vers les îles, la migration et la mobilité des groupes professionnels à l'intérieur ou à l'extérieur de la région de l'Égée, et enfin le rôle des monastères dans le développement des réseaux de communication dans l'espace insulaire.

IANNIS C. CARRAS

ABSTRACT: One of the central figures of the Enlightenment in the Greek world, Evgenios Voulgaris (1716-1806) has been criticised for becoming increasingly reactionary in later years. This article argues that an understanding of the importance of place and movement in Voulgaris' world –as also in his world-view– helps explain elements of continuity and change in his writings more generally.

Rather than a shift from enlightenment to reaction, the article depicts a slow progression from an early Voulgaris intent –both in his writings and in the Athos Academy– on fusing Orthodoxy and Enlightenment, to a later Voulgaris less intent on creating a rational system out of the many influences on his thought and more insistent on the creation of a place for the Graikoi, liberated from the Ottomans.

The complex inter-relation between the geographic, political and social conditions and the thought processes of one particular individual are examined. Given these conditions, and bearing in mind the dangers of a crude geographic determinism, Voulgaris' attempts to reconcile, indeed create a rational system out of the many influences on his thought, present considerable interest but were inevitably unlikely to succeed.

IOANNIS D. EVRIGENIS

ABSTRACT: In 1823, shortly after the outbreak of the Greek Revolution, and in the context of a general attempt to gather support for the Greek cause, Adamantios Koraes wrote to Thomas Jefferson, whom he had met once in Paris, to request his advice on the founding of a Greek state. Although brief, the exchange between the two men provides a rare, if not unique, record of a founder's advice to an aspiring emulator. Koraes' role in Greek political and intellectual life, coupled with Jefferson's fame, have made the correspondence between the two men a source of some interest among Greek scholars,

but Jefferson's advice has never been studied in the context of his broader political theory. This paper traces the history of the acquaintance of the two men and of their subsequent correspondence, and places Jefferson's recommendations in the context of his political thought. Written as it was with the benefit of a long life in politics and more than forty-five years of experience from the American founding, Jefferson's advice to Koraes provides a singular opportunity to assess his political ideas over time.

LIZ POTTER

ABSTRACT: This article offers a case study of George Finlay, a British philhellene whose intellectual make-up deserves more attention than it has previously been given (1). Unlike many Western European philhelennes who returned home disillusioned with Greece, Finlay spent his life in Athens (2); and unlike the overwhelmingly classicising Hellenism of his British contemporaries, his was a Hellenism that insisted on the interest and instructiveness of the history of Greece from the Roman period onwards (3). From a study of his *History of Greece BC 146 to AD 1864* (4), and an analysis of its influences (5) and its uses (6), the article portrays Finlay as a complex, supple and interesting thinker. He is of particular interest to the nineteenth-century historian of political ideas for the ways in which he inherited and re-shaped ideas associated with civic virtue, philosophic history and contemporary liberalism.

LEONIDAS KALLIVRETAKIS

ABSTRACT: This article treats the recent assumption made by Vernian specialist William Butcher that Jules Verne's most famous character, Captain Nemo, is based on the French revolutionary intellectual Gustave Flourens (1838-1871), son of the eminent physiologist J. P. M. Flourens. Gustave Flourens fought in the Cretan insurrection of 1866-1868, later participated in the republican opposition against Napoleon III's imperial regime, eventually became a friend of Karl Marx and was finally killed as a general of the Paris Commune. By comparing step-by-step Verne's inspiration and writing procedures with Flourens' unfolding activities and fame, it is concluded that there is little basis for such an assumption. The article includes also a brief account of the Cretan question in the nineteenth century and of the deep discord between Marx's and Flourens' respective analyses of the Eastern Question.

EVRIDIKI SIFNEOS

ABSTRACT: This article summarizes the conclusions of a study on entrepreneurial activities related to the cycle of the olive-oil economy in Lesvos, an island in the North-Eastern Aegean, from the eighteenth century until the middle of the twentieth century. It is based on research and observations drawn from a multiform primary material, such as companies' records, communal and family archives, consular and administrative reports, as well as secondary sources which allow comparisons with other oleiferous regions and connect the economy of Lesvos to the broader Aegean and Mediterranean environment. It points out that the single cultivation phenomenon, though associated to the economy of risk, obeyed to the market's command and was prepared by the abolition of the governor's monopoly on the oil trading and the consequent opening of the market. This

enabled the Christian ottoman subjects to develop the administration of intensive olive growing, mechanized oil extraction and trade expansion. Olive oil and soap were the two basic commodities of the island's export revenues that were commercialised, despite their low quality, into a wide range of port and island markets of the Asia Minor coast, the Aegean islands and the Black Sea. Moreover, the article explores the type of commercial and industrial enterprises and the characteristics of the olive-cycle entrepreneurs. It concludes with the commercial crisis suffered from the major political and economic changes of the twentieth century and the consequent reorientation of Lesvos' businessmen towards Crete and Piraeus, the olive manufacturing centres of the Neohellenic state.

FOREWORD

The National Hellenic Research Foundation was founded in 1958 by royal decree (hence originally denominated the Royal Research Foundation) as a state-funded institution outside the narrow public sector, designed to carry out and to support basic research in the natural sciences and the humanities. Thus the “two cultures debate” was constitutionally established as the basic intellectual framework of the new foundation. The foundation was subsequently housed in an imposing building designed and constructed under the supervision of one of Greece’s most eminent architects, Constantinos Doxiadis, on land given by the crown in an area in central Athens where the royal stables used to stand in the past. A grant from the Ford Foundation allowed the construction of the building. In 1960 one of the co-founders of the new Research Foundation, C. Th. Dimaras, an eminent literary historian, established the “Centre for Neohellenic Research” as one of the Foundation’s constitutive institutes. Dimaras conceived the CNR as a research unit on Greek cultural history since 1453, focusing primarily on the systematic study of source material and primary evidence on intellectual and cultural trends, as against what he judged the rather rhetorical approach that had hitherto prevailed in the study of intellectual phenomena. On account of Dimaras’ own interest in the period of the Enlightenment, whose study he had pioneered in Greek historical and literary research, the Centre’s early projects focused mostly on this period. Within this general orientation important research projects were initiated focusing on the history of the book, the history of the press, forms of cultural exchanges between East and West, the history of Modern Greek philosophy and the comparative study of intercultural phenomena such as travel literature, translations and multilingualism.

In the 1980s, the Centre went through a phase of major expansion in its human resources and in the range of its research interests. In this new phase new research fields were added to the CNR’s activity: economic history, historical demography, history of ecclesiastical institutions, history of science. Still later more novel fields of research were added: business history, industrial archeology, historical cartography. These changes brought new members to the Centre and enriched the intellectual atmosphere and the exchange of ideas.

Work in the Centre is organized in a general infrastructure programme, comprising research projects focusing primarily on source material, and in specialized thematic programmes.

Since the 1960s, the Centre has been publishing a series of research publications and monographs, which comprises over eighty titles. In addition since 1982 it publishes the periodical research series *Tετράδια Εργασίας/ Cahiers de Recherche*, currently in its twenty eighth number. Five international history congresses since 1981 have produced imposing volumes and many other colloquia have been published in addition. A collection in the History of Ideas was inaugurated in 2001, featuring five titles to date. An annual *Newsletter* records the activity of the Institute and its members and provides a medium of communication with the scholarly community.

In December 2000, the CNR, officially renamed the Institute for Neohellenic Research since 1985, celebrated its fortieth anniversary. It was an occasion for paying tribute to its founder and to the group of pioneers who had worked with him in the initial phases of the Institute's operation, but also it was an occasion for self-reflection and self-appraisal. In thinking about the way forward it was felt that it was high time for a more active opening of the Institute to the international community of scholars. In discussions among the members of the Institute it was concluded that in order to fulfill its mission as a component of Greece's National Research Foundation the INR needed to make its research known to a broader academic public and to create a medium of communication and exchange of ideas with colleagues elsewhere in Europe and in the world. It was thus that the *Historical Review/La Revue Historique* came into being. Our intention is to provide by this means a medium of dialogue and reflection in the broad field of historical study in the human sciences, not necessarily confined to Modern Greek subjects. We trust that our colleagues in Greece, our Balkan and Mediterranean neighbours and scholars around the world will join us in this initiative of openness and collaboration and joint exploration in the world of ideas.

Paschalis M. Kitromilides